

STUDIES IN SOCIAL ANTHROPOLOGY AND ETHNOLOGY

ALTERNATYVI MODERNYBĖ: TRADICIJA, IDENTITETAS IR DISKURSAS Sudarytojas VYTIS ČIUBRINSKAS

ALTERNATIVE MODERNITIES: TRADITION, IDENTITY AND DISCOURSEEdited by VYTIS ČIUBRINSKAS

LIETUVOS ISTORIJOS INSTITUTAS LITHUANIAN INSTITUTE OF HISTORY

LII VILNIUS 2010

REDAKCINĖ KOLEGIJA

Vytis Čiubrinskas (vyriausiasis redaktorius) Vytauto Didžiojo universitetas

Auksuolė Čepaitienė Lietuvos istorijos institutas

Jonathan Friedman École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales Kalifornijos universitetas, San Diegas

Orvar Löfgren Lundo universitetas

Jonas Mardosa Vilniaus pedagoginis universitetas

Žilvytis Šaknys Lietuvos istorijos institutas

REDAKCINĖS KOLEGIJOS SEKRETORĖ Danguolė Svidinskaitė Lietuvos istorijos institutas

Lietuvos etnologija: socialinės antropologijos ir etnologijos studijos – etnologijos ir socialinės/kultūrinės antropologijos mokslo žurnalas, nuo 2001 m. leidžiamas vietoj tęstinio monografijų ir studijų leidinio "Lietuvos etnologija". Jame spausdinami moksliniai straipsniai, konferencijų pranešimai, knygų recenzijos ir apžvalgos, kurių temos pirmiausia apima Lietuvą ir Vidurio/Rytų Europą. Žurnalas siekia pristatyti mokslo aktualijas ir skatinti teorines bei metodines diskusijas. Tekstai skelbiami lietuvių arba anglų kalba.

Redakcijos adresas: Lietuvos istorijos institutas Kražių g. 5 LT-01108 Vilnius

Tel.: + 370 5 262 9410 Faks: + 370 5 261 1433 El. paštas: etnolog@istorija.lt v.ciubrinskas@smf.vdu.lt

Žurnalas registruotas:

European Reference Index for the Humanities (ERIH)

EBSCO Publishing: Academic Search Complete, Humanities International Complete,

SocINDEX with Full Text

Modern Language Association (MLA) International Bibliography

TURINYS / CONTENTS

Pratarmė (Vytis Čiubrinskas)	
Straipsniai / Articles	
Vytis Čiubrinskas Įvadas į alternatyvios modernybės studijas. Permąstant socialinę kultūrinę kaitą: tradicija, identitetas ir diskursas Introduction. Alternative Modernities: Tradition, Identity and Discourse. Summary	
Jonathan D. Hill The Politics of Indigenous Identities in South America, 1989–1998	
David Sutton Between Memory and Modernity: Moral Temporalities in Kalymnos, Greece	
Ingo W. Schröder Against 'Identity': Exploring Alternative Approaches to the Study of the Politics of Local Culture	
Neringa Klumbytė Post-Socialist Sensations: Nostalgia, the Self, and Alterity in Lithuania 9 Posovietinės jausenos: nostalgija, savastis ir marginalizacija Lietuvoje. Santrauka	
Aet Annist Outsourcing Culture: Establishing Heritage Hegemony by Funding Cultural Life in South Eastern Estonia	
Romualdas Apanavičius Etnologijos studijos Lietuvoje 1927–2005 metais	

Receilings if apzvaigos / Reviews	
Rasa Paukštytė-Šaknienė, Vida Savoniakaitė, Žilvytis Šaknys, Irma Šidiškienė. Lietuvos kultūra: Aukštaitijos papročiai. Šaknys Ž. (sud.) (Rasa Račiūnaitė-Paužuolienė)	165
Vytis Čiubrinskas. Socialinės ir kultūrinės antropologijos teorijos (Auksuolė Čepaitienė)	169
Representations on the Margins of Europe: Politics and Identities in the Baltic and South Caucasian States. Darieva T. and Kaschuba W. (eds.)	150
(Ingo W. Schröder)	
Konferencijos / Conferences	170
10-oji EASA konferencija Slovėnijoje (Auksuolė Čepaitienė, Vytis Čiubrinskas) Konferencija "Etninės kultūros tradicijų tęstinumas ir iššūkiai šiuolaikinėje visuomenėje" (Andželika Lapinskienė, Kęstutis Meškys)	
Sukaktys	
Lietuviškosios tautotyros profesionalui Jonui Baliui – 100 metų (<i>Vytis Čiubrinskas</i>) Vitaliui Morkūnui – 80 (<i>Žilvytis Šaknys</i>)	
In Memoriam	
Rita Marija Pilkaitė-Butvilienė (<i>Irena Regina Merkienė</i>)	191

The Politics of Indigenous Identities in South America, 1989–1998¹

Jonathan D. Hill

This essay documents three contrasting ways in which indigenous South American peoples were engaged in constructing alternative modernities in Colombia and Venezuela during the 1980s and '90s. Local politics of identities are comparatively analyzed within the long-term historical context of nation-state expansions into Amazonia and in relation to recent and ongoing debates in anthropology and transnational indigenous activism over indigenous peoples' cultural and territorial rights of self-determination. I argue that anthropologists can and should play an important role in helping indigenous communities to navigate the complex and rapidly changing political conditions in the contemporary world.

Professor Jonathan D. Hill, Department of Anthropology, Southern Illinois University, M.C. 4502, Carbondale, IL 62901, USA, e-mail: jhill@siu.edu

Introduction

The primary goal of this essay is to explore the cultural politics of identity in South America through describing and interpreting the diverse directions of change that were unfolding in three indigenous communities where I did fieldwork in the 1980s and '90s. These three case studies will provide close-up, on-the-ground views of the different ways in which indigenous peoples of Colombia and Venezuela were constructing alternative modernities in dramatically different, rapidly changing national contexts during the closing years of the 20th century. An important theme that cuts across the three case studies is that struggles over identity at the local level are as much about matters of meaning construction, discourse, and cultural performance as they are concerned with struggles over institutionalized power and economic inequality.

These local political struggles over identity are rooted in deeper, broader contexts of an expanding nationalist modernity that originated in the early

LIETUVOS ETNOLOGIJA: socialinės antropologijos ir etnologijos studijos. 2009, 9(18), 23-53.

¹Revised version of paper presented at Social Anthropology Seminar Cycle, Social Anthropology Center, Faculty of Social Sciences, Vytautus Magnus University, Kaunas, Lithuania, May 21, 2009.

19th century during the Wars of Independence and their immediate aftermath. The European concept of liberal nation-state placed indigenous peoples of lowland South America into contradictory social situations. On the one hand, the liberal state promised civil and legal equality to all citizens within its borders. On the other hand, the rationalist, assimilationist, individualist nature of this promised equality was extremely hostile to the older, royalist policy of granting collective rights to indigenous peoples as well as to the survival of indigenous modes of economic production and social organization.² From their very inception during the War of Independence, liberal nation-states in Latin America perceived indigenous peoples, or "the natural citizens," as potential equals only if they could be educated and brought into more direct contact with other people.

The new republics of 19th century Latin America defined indigenous collectivities as marginalized, backward groups whose very existence threatened social order and progress. For example, the Law of July 30, 1824 ("Methods of Civilizing the Savage Indians") in the Republic of Gran Colombia offered tools and land to indigenous groups who agreed to accept more sedentary settlement patterns, and those who agreed would be exempted from the military draft if they renounced their non-Christian customs (Rausch 1984: 208). The nation-state pulled indigenous peoples of lowland South America in two conflicting directions. They could assimilate into the new national order, but only at the cost of renouncing their indigenous cultural practices and identities. If they chose to reject the new order of society, they were categorized as savage, wild, and sub-human.³

Perhaps the clearest historical documentation of the double-sidedness of relations between the newly independent state and indigenous peoples is in the series of land laws passed during the 19th century. At the Congress of Cúcuta, the new government made clear its intention to abolish the missionaries' system

² To the authors of the Constitution of the Province of Caracas in 1812, the two-sidedness of equality at the expense of diversity was not perceived as a contradiction but as the natural process of educating backward peoples, who would relinquish uncivilized ways of life when lifted out of their former ignorance.

[&]quot;...endeavor by all possible means to attract the above-mentioned natural citizens to those houses of enlightenment and learning, to make them understand the intimate union that they have with all other citizens, ..., and the rights that they enjoy by the mere fact of being men who are equal to all members of their species, with the goal of succeeding by this means in removing them from the depression and rusticity in which the old state of things has maintained them, and that they no longer remain isolated and afraid to deal with other men" (Constitución de la Provincia de Caracas 1812, quoted from Grau 1987: 66, translation mine).

 $^{^3}$ See Hill 1999 for a more detailed, contextual analysis of this theme during the rise of independent, liberal states in South America.

of indigenous tribute and to "reintegrate" church-protected *resguardo* lands in the Decree of May 20, 1820. However, as the situation in Guiana and other regions had shown beyond any doubt, the leaders of the War of Independence lacked any clear plan or vision for creating new political spaces that would allow indigenous peoples to retain collective land ownership in the absence of missionaries. Faced with the reality of indigenous flight from areas of conflict and increased *mestizo* presence, the new government on at least one occasion was prepared to consider allowing indigenous people a measure of autonomy over local political affairs. In the first article of the Regulations for Governing the Missions, written in July of 1817,

it was reiterated to the Commissioners that they must treat indigenous people very well, making them understand that upon the completion of the war against Guiana, they would remain in charge of governing themselves without any constraint other than that of the supreme authority of the Republic (Grau 1987: 921).

Unfortunately, this call for indigenous self-rule at local and regional levels within the overarching authority of the nation-state was completely drowned out in the chaos of warfare and the power vacuum of the post-war years.

The welter of contradictory land laws passed throughout the 19th century shows that the expansion of nationalism was not a simple, straight-forward, top-down process of establishing control over indigenous peoples and their lands. Rather, the national state simultaneously included indigenous peoples as individual citizens or landowners and excluded them as collective identities or corporate socialities. That duality, I would argue, is still the hallmark of indigenous relations to the states of Latin America today.

Recent efforts by the UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations (WGIP) and other transnational activist organizations have begun to chip away at the underlying bedrock of individualism that has largely blocked any progress towards internationally recognized laws protecting collective rights of self-determination for indigenous peoples. As Muehlebach has observed these

developments pertaining to indigenous rights in international law point towards an emerging international conception of self-determination as a fundamental human right based on notions of justice and human solidarity, and of "peoples" as collectivities characterized more by their marginalized positionality within existing state structures than by a collective desire to secede. In fact, the meaning of self-determination that indigenous activists proffer at the UN seeks to rid the concept of its association with the break-up of states while simultaneously propagating models of collective decision making and freedom not guaranteed in liberal democratic polities (Muehlebach 2003: 245).

The current transnational movement for redefining indigenous self-determination is both universalizing and culturally specific. Collective rights are not new rights pertaining exclusively to indigenous peoples but specific instances of a universal human right – the protection and enhancement of the human capacity for culture – that has never before been codified in liberal national states.

The definition of "indigenous groups" is also undergoing significant redefinition in this transnational movement. Territorial precedence remains one criterion among many others for defining "indigenous groups" but is no longer viewed as an isolated, essentialized basis for making legal claims. ""Indigenous" has come to be attached as much, if not more, with a particular culturally, politically, and economically marginalized positionality within nation-states as it has with territorial precedence" (Muehlebach 2003: 250-251). Indeed, in some exceptional cases, such as the large Quechua-speaking populations of highland Ecuador, territoriality has become largely irrelevant to indigenous efforts to carve out new forms of autonomy based on relations of interdependency with the nation-state and global economy rather than on ancestral territories within the state (Colloredo-Mansfeld 2002). In most cases, however, including the three indigenous South American communities discussed below, "indigenous groups do not have the bargaining power to properly negotiate the terms and form of a so-called "relational self-determination," particularly when the exploitation of natural resources are in question. They differ in their capacity to give truly informed consent to what is happening to their lands, waters, seas, forests, and sub-surface resources" (Muehlebach 2003: 258). In any case, the current movement for redefining indigenous self-determination is better understood as an effort to broaden existing, highly individualized concepts of human rights to include collective rights of self-determination rooted in "notions of culture as collective and territorialized practice" (Muehlebach 2003: 261) rather than an essentializing, exclusivist, or secessionist push for autonomous ethnic territories.

These sophisticated and nuanced ways of redefining indigenous self-determination are opening up new spaces for local communities to struggle against dominant (assimilationist) ideologies and global economic forces. At the same time, transnational indigenous activism provides new opportunities and ethical obligations for anthropologists to use their detailed knowledge of local cultural practices and historical memories to help advance the interests of indigenous peoples.

Not all academic anthropologists view the new transnational indigenous activism in such favorable terms. Adam Kuper (Kuper 2003), for example, paints a highly negative picture of "the indigenous-peoples movement" as a racialized, romanticized revival of older notions of "the primitive." After a brief

survey of several examples of identity politics gone amok in various parts of North America and Africa, Kuper reaches the conclusion that

whatever the political inspiration, the conventional lines of argument currently used to justify "indigenous" land claims rely on obsolete anthropological notions and on a romantic and false ethnographic vision. Fostering essentialist ideologies of culture and identity, they may have dangerous political consequences (Kuper 2003: 395).

Instead of critiquing essentialism in order to move beyond exclusionist politics, Kuper falls into an even greater essentialism by portraying the entire "indigenous-peoples movement" as a racialized leftist political agenda.

Wherever special land and hunting rights have been extended to so-called indigenous peoples, local ethnic frictions have been exacerbated. These grants also foster appeals to uncomfortably racist criteria for favouring or excluding individuals or communities. New identities are fabricated and spokespeople identified who are bound to be unrepresentative and may be effectively the creation of political parties and NGOs (Kuper 2003: 395).

Were these assertions originating from an obscure individual in a minor academic publication, we could perhaps afford to ignore such serious misconstruals of contemporary indigenous activism. However, coming from a senior anthropologist of international stature and published in the largest, most prestigious international journal of anthropology, they require a clear refutation.⁴

The main problem underlying Kuper's argument is a failure to distinguish between two different orderings of political action and ideas, "identity politics" and "the politics of identity."

'Identity politics' is one way we suggest to view how culture and identity, variously perceived to be traditional, modern, radical, local, regional, religious, gender, class and ethnic, are articulated, constructed, invented and commodified as the means to achieve political ends. In this sense we see identity politics as discourse and action within public arenas of political and civil society, wherein culture is used to subvert, support, protect and attack, and where identity cannot be understood without some recourse to wider theorizing and comparisons of the institutions, practices and ideologies of national states, governments, political parties, transnational corporations, non-governmental organizations, and international and supranational organizations, like the United Nations and the European Union. We contrast this with the 'politics of identity', which, while overlapping in real terms with the type of identity politics just suggested, here refers more to issues of personal and group power,

⁴I will focus my critique of Kuper's article on the weakness of his general argument rather than on the thinness of empirical support of the argument. For a discussion of these more specific problems, see Alcida Ramos' thoughtful commentary: "Poor argumentation contributes to the paper's sour flavor" (Ramos 2003: 397).

found within and across all social and political institutions and collectivities, where people sometimes choose, and sometimes are forced, to interact with each other in part on the basis of their shared, or divergent, notions of their identities. The politics of identity can take place in any social setting, and are often best and first recognized in domains of the private, the subaltern, the subversive, where culture may be the best way or means to express one's loss or triumph, while identity politics depend to a great deal on institutions and application of economic and political power, within and sometimes across generally accepted administrative boundaries (Hill and Wilson 2003: 2).

Both "identity politics" and "the politics of identity" depend upon power relations, and they are connected or even generated by what are perceived by self and group as "identities." However, "identity politics" refers mainly to the "top down" processes whereby various political, economic, and other social entities attempt to mold collective identities, based on ethnicity, race, language, and place, into relatively fixed and "naturalized" (or fetishized, commoditized, nationalized, exoticized, folkloricized, etc.) frames for understanding political action and the body politic. The "politics of identity" refers to a more "bottom up" process through which local people challenge, subvert, or negotiate culture and identity and contest structures of power and wealth that constrain their social lives.

Kuper's article (Kuper 2003) fails to recognize the difference between politically motivated "identity politics" and "the politics of identity" through which indigenous and other marginalized peoples are struggling for self-determination, including the right to socially define and historically reproduce specific cultural identities as collective and (in most cases) territorialized practices. Kuper's critiques of identity politics are selectively extracted from complex historical settings; woodenly compared as though South Africa, North America, and Amazonia all had identical histories; and consist of little more than fleeting glimpses of isolated cases, mainly from Canada and South Africa. Such critiques of identity politics are valuable when done as part of a broader project of social and historical contextualizing and theoretical analysis (see, e.g., Hill and Staats 2002; Overmyer-Velázquez 2003; McKinley 2003; Boccara 2003; Santos-Granero 2002; Rabinowitz 2002; Helman 2002; Godreau 2002). By any current standards of scholarly writing, Kuper's article fails to make a significant contribution to this growing literature. Kuper alludes to potentially "dangerous political consequences" of propagating "essentialist ideologies of culture and identity" (Kuper 2003: 395), yet he would do well to consider the harmful intellectual and political results of generalizing from a few scattered examples of identity politics to the full spectrum of legitimate anthropological attempts to examine the interplay of power, culture, and identity in the everyday life

of individuals and communities, in the interstitial spaces and dehistoricized times of contemporary local and global transformations.⁵

Moreover, Kuper's wholesale dismissal of indigenous activism as nothing more than cultural essentialism fails to do justice to the complex ways in which such cultural essences are strategically constructed, manipulated, challenged, and rejected by indigenous peoples. As Kay Warren and Jean Jackson have observed:

...groups inevitably mix strategic essentialism with other lines of argument to legitimize their existence... For anthropologists, the issue is not proving or disproving a particular essentialized view of culture but rather examining the way essences are constructed in practice and disputed in political rhetoric (Warren and Jackson 2002: 8–9).

Anthropological studies of indigenous movements in various Latin American countries have provided careful, detailed, and substantive critiques of the political and economic cleavages within indigenous communities created through identity politics. However, these same studies (e.g., Hill and Staats 2002; Jackson 1989; Jackson 1995; Graham 2002; Gow and Rappaport 2002; Turner 2002; Whitten 2003) have also demonstrated sophisticated ways of counteracting the divisive effects of identity politics through political discourses and actions that undermine or neutralize cultural essentialism. The general picture that emerges from this literature is not one of indigenous activists and their followers as mere puppets dancing to a monophonic melody of cultural essentialism but a scenario in which a polyphony of competing discourses, voices, and representations are employed in ways that allow communities of indigenous people to find their own, culturally specific solutions to major social, economic, political, and ecological problems.

In the following pages, I will examine the politics of identities in three indigenous South American localities where I did fieldwork in the 1980s and '90s. Among other things, these three case studies will demonstrate how the dominant ideologies of liberal nation-states have continued to inform the politics of identity at the local level even as global and regional political orderings have shifted in new directions in the post-Cold War era. The national contexts of these three communities, the first in Colombia in 1989 and the other two in Venezuela in 1998, differed in several profound ways in spite of their geographic

⁵In her commentary on Kuper's article, Alcida Ramos concludes that "Particularly regarding the thorny issue of ethnic resurgence what we need is serious anthropological research, rather than casual generalizations, and open-minded anthropologists who neither adopt indigenous causes as an article of faith nor reject ethnic struggles as racist manipulations by unscrupulous opportunists" (Ramos 2003: 398).

proximity. During the mid-1980s, the Colombian government had granted legal titles for large areas of land inhabited by indigenous peoples. Some of the largest of these areas were along the Vaupés, Caquetá, and Putumayo rivers in southeastern Colombia. Concurrently, indigenous peoples formed a plethora of new regional organizations, such as CRIVA in the Vaupés basin, that served as intermediaries between local communities and the national government.⁶ The late 1980s was also a period when Pablo Escobar and other major figures in the international cocaine cartel began to engage in increasingly violent conflict with the national government. This violence escalated in late 1989 with the assassination of a leading presidential candidate and the bombing of the main federal law enforcement agency's headquarters in Bogotá. By the end of 1989, all of Colombia had been placed into an emergency "national state of seige." Insurgent political groups, such as FARC and ELN, took advantage of these chaotic conditions by establishing control over more and more rural lands, especially in remote, densely forested frontier areas. By the late 1990s, the flow of raw coca from Peru had shifted from nocturnal air transports to overland routes along trails and streams winding through the forests of southeastern Colombia. The multi-billion dollar drug trade increasingly overlapped with political insurgency, resulting in the late 20th century hybrid know as "narcoguerrillas." In November 1998, the FARC and its drug-lord allies attacked the Colombian military base at Mitú on the Vaupés River, and the entire region has continued since then to serve as a major stronghold for the guerrillas in their negotiations with the national government.

In Venezuela, the 1980s and '90s were a period of steady economic decline as falling oil prices pierced the Oil Boom bubble of the 1960s and '70s. As late as 1980, Venezuela's per capita income was the highest in Latin America, and the country was not technically classified as part of the impoverished Third World. Its currency, the *bolivar*, held its exchange value at 4.3 to the U.S. dollar. In 1983 the *bolivar* fell to 14 per U.S. \$1, and by 1993 it hovered between 90 to 100 per U.S. \$1. By 1998 the *bolivar* traded at 650 to 700 per U.S. \$1, and the country was on the threshhold of a major political transformation: the election of Hugo Chavez's Fifth Republic Movement and the end of the "partidocracia," or two party system. As the leader of a failed military *coup d'etat* in 1992, Chavez was not a newcomer to the national political arena. His subsequent conviction and imprisonment for two years made him a martyr for many Venezuelans living in poverty. After President Rafael Caldera pardoned him in 1994, Chavez launched

⁶ See Jackson 1999 for an important analysis of the contradictions embodied in CRIVA and other emerging indigenous organizations in Colombia during the 1980s and early '90s.

a populist campaign for the presidency aimed at eliminating "coruptocracia" and establishing entirely new forms of national government.

Just a few months after Chávez took office, distinctive landmarks of the Venezuelan political landscape quietly crumbled. The National Congress and Supreme Court were dismantled without signs of public affliction. As if they had aged overnight after the elections of 1998, AD and Copei, the political parties that during half a century had so dominated politics that politics without them seemed unimaginable, appeared to be in their death throes (Coronil 2000: 38).

Thus, although the changes unfolding in Venezuela during the 1980s and '90s were far less violent than those happening in Colombia during the same years, they were no less profound.

Compartmentalized Modernity: Indigenous Identities in the Besieged Nation-State

In late June 1989, I set out for Bogotá, Colombia, where I was to participate in a collaborative study of the social and ecologial effects of goldmining on indigenous communities along the lower Caquetá River and its tributary, the Mirití-Paraná.⁷ I had brought along several copies of cassette tape recordings of indigenous narratives, ritual chants, and flute music that I had made in the early 1980s during my fieldwork with the Arawak-speaking Wakuénai of the Upper Rio Negro region in Venezuela. Upon reaching Yukuna and Tanimuka round-house villages along the Mirití-Paraná River, I talked with local elders and shamans about my previous fieldwork with the Wakuénai of Venezuela and played some of my recordings for them. As we listened to the tapes, several men began commenting in Spanish that these performances were very similar in some ways, yet different in other important ways, from their own oral traditions. One man even launched into a historical narrative about a group of long-lost cousins who had separated from the Yukuna and Tanimuka almost 200 years ago.8 This story stimulated a discussion of words and phrases from Yukuna, Tanimuka, and Wakuénai languages, leading to the realization that there were many lexical cognates in the three languages. By the end of an hour

⁷The project was supported by funds from Cultural Survival, Inc., and entailed interviewing of indigenous men and women who had worked in the mines during the previous dry season. There was no direct access to the mines in June and July, 1989, in part because of the heavy rains and high river levels but also because the mines were controlled by guerilllas from the FARC.

⁸ The histories of different Arawak-speaking peoples are still being documented and have only recently come under comparative scrutiny (Hill and Santos-Granero 2002).

or so, a group consisting mostly of elders and shamans but also a few younger men and their wives had gathered to listen to and comment on the tapes, and several people asked me if I would return at some future time to carry out a complete, in-depth study of their narratives, music, and ritual speeches. I was, of course, delighted by the enthusiastic response of my indigenous hosts to my recordings from Venezuela and began to envision a fascinating study of Yukuna and Tanimuka musical and narrative traditions that would open up a comparative perspective from northeastern and southwestern territories of contemporary Arawak-speaking peoples in the greater Northwest Amazon region of Venezuela, Colombia, and Brazil. Unfortunately, I have not yet been



Figure 1. Yukuna roundhouse Cáno Mirití-Paraná, Colombia, 20 July 1989 (Photo by Jonathan D. Hill)

(and may never be) able to return to the Yukuna and Tanimuka villages along the Mirití-Paraná River due to the increasingly unstable political conditions throughout the forested areas of southeastern Colombia during the 1990s.

Colombian Independence Day falls on July 20 and coincides in the Caquetá region with the ripening of pineapples that have been planted in new swidden gardens during the previous January-through-March dry season.¹⁰ The village where I was staying had one of the largest and

most impressive ceremonial round-houses in the region (see Figure 1), as well as a large clearing with a level field suitable for soccer matches. A number of affinal relatives and other guests from nearby villages assembled at the round-house for a day-long celebration of Colombian Independence Day and the pineapple harvest. Over the course of the day, however, it became clear that these two celebratory purposes were not meant to be blended together into some curiously hybrid form but were to be kept separate from one another

⁹ Between the Wakuénai, Baniwa, and Guarequena of Venezuela and the Yukuna and Tanimuka of Colombia lies the extensive area of Eastern Tukano-speaking peoples of the Vaupés basin in Colombia and Brazil (see, e.g., Goldman 1963; Reichel-Dolmatoff 1971; Reichel-Dolmatoff 1975; Jackson 1983; Chernela 1993; Hugh-Jones S. 1979; Hugh-Jones C. 1979).

¹⁰ The term dry season is somewhat misleading, since the Caquetį is located almost directly on the Equator, where there is no really dry season. However, in January through March there is a "less wet" season when river levels fall to a minimum before rising again to their highest annual levels in July and August.

in time and space. Independence Day was to be commemorated *outside* the roundhouse in the *morning*, whereas the pineapple-harvest festival was to be held *inside* the roundhouse in the *afternoon* and *evening*. And once the transition from national modernity to local indigeneity had been made, there was no possibility of turning back from the latter to the former.

Independence Day began in a very nationalistic manner with the raising of the Colombian national flag and singing of the national anthem in front of the round-house. Only a few elders came outside to observe this brief ceremony, which was led by a young man who was the official Comisario of the village. Immediately following the flag-raising ceremony, a group of young men from the hosts' village challenged their guests to a soccer match on the field in front of the round-house. As I had had considerable experience playing soccer on university teams and coaching youth soccer in the U.S., I volunteered to serve as referee for the match. The game quickly turned into a rout, as the host team scored six unanswered goals. By the time an hour had passed, the hosts were leading by a score of fifteen to zero, the guests were ready to call it quits, and I blew the final whistle to officially end the match. Soccer games between villages are also quite popular along the Rio Negro in Venezuela. Playing soccer in Colombia, however, is much more directly linked to national identity than it is in Venezuela, where soccer is far less engraved into national consciousness than baseball and basketball. Much like the situation in Brazil, the status of soccer in Colombia as an official pastime and icon of national identity is widely accepted.¹¹

In the early afternoon, a group of elders and their wives gathered in the center of the round-house to supervise the making of large vats of fermented pineapple "wine" for the evening's celebration. Over the course of the day, guests (including the visiting anthropologists) were allowed to hang their hammocks and personal belongings on the low posts at the periphery of the round-house, leaving a large circular space for dancing around the four enormous poles holding up the much higher central portions of the roof. In the last hour before sunset, women from the host village began distributing gourd dippers filled with a mildly fermented, tangy-sweet pineapple wine. A large quantity of dried coca leaves had been previously ground up into a

¹¹ See Carter 2002 for an overview of the emerging interest among anthropologists in studies of sport as a marker of national, religious, and other identities. Recent studies of soccer and national identities include Armstrong's analysis (Armstrong 2002) of the culturally specific ways in which soccer has been employed in Liberia since 1998 in the reconstruction of national identity and Sorek's interpretation (Sorek 2002) of how Arab-Palestinians living within Israel use the Islamic Soccer League as a way to socialize the secular power of soccer into sacred Islamic traditions.

bright green powder, and men began placing spoonfuls of the coca powder into the pouches of their cheeks. As the darkness of night arrived, torches were lit and hung from the four main house posts. Quartets of men played long, high-pitched ceremonial flutes. Accompanied by female dance partners, the flute players moved in broad, counterclockwise circles around and between the four main house posts. Like the dancers' spatial movements and the shape of the round-house, flute music celebrating the pineapple harvest outlined a stable, symmetrical melodic pattern: first ascending and descending, then descending and ascending, always returning to the center or beginning. This same musical-dance pattern continued for more than three hours with only short intermissions for drinking pineapple wine, smoking tobacco, and sucking coca powder. Looking up at the night sky through an opening above the center of the round-house and sandwiched between the inner circle of musical dancers and the outer ring of spectators, the world itself began to feel round. The vast world of forests and rivers outside the walls of the round-house – including the turbulent, noisy, violent Colombian state - seemed to fade into the distance. All that mattered was the circle of people, musical sound, and pineapple wine contained inside the round-house.

Later in the night, however, the tranquility had evidently become too serene for many of the younger men and women in the round-house. There were murmurings and rumors about playing "música de los blancos," or Colombian popular music, on boomboxes so that young couples could dance to the lively rhythms of cumbia. The Comisario came over to me and asked whether or not it would be acceptable to turn on one of the young people's boomboxes to play "música de los blancos." Being an outsider and newcomer to the community, I was at first somewhat surprised by his question. It dawned on me that the Comisario and other young people had overheard the previous day's conversations with the elders and shamans about indigenous music and that I had come to be regarded as an authority on musical matters. I also suspected that this seemingly innocent question about musical styles reflected deeper issues of intergenerational power and change within the community and among the Yukuna and Tanimuka in general. In any case, I felt that to give my opinion one way or the other would have been inappropriate,12 so I suggested that the Comisario poll all the people present to find out what was the majority sentiment. During a break in the playing of ceremonial flutes, the Comisario called out for everyone's attention and asked who would prefer to switch from

¹² Personally, my heart sank when the Comisario asked me this question, because I had attended many similar social gatherings along the Rio Negro in Venezuela where couples danced almost until dawn with nonstop highly amplified music and heavy drinking.

indigenous flute music to "tocadisco," or "música de los blancos." Immediately, a large number of hands and a cacaphony of voices from one side of the round-house indicated opinions strongly in favor of making the switch. Although a couple of men stated their opposition to playing *tocadisco* music, the overwhelming majority of those willing to vote on the question were "ayes." The Comisario left the round-house and returned a few minutes later with a large boombox, which he began to set up on a table near the periphery of the round-house. However, he never turned on the machine's power. Quietly but to great effect, the elders and shamans had informed the Comisario and other young men that it was forbidden to start playing "música de los blancos" once the ceremonial music of the pineapple harvest festival had gotten under way. No further explanation was given, nor was one needed. If the elders stated that mixing Colombian popular music with indigenous flute playing was dangerous, no one was willing to openly challenge or disobey their judgment.

Many Arawak-speaking peoples throughout South America, and especially those living in Northwestern Amazonia, have strongly hierarchical modes of political organization based on differential control over mythic and historical knowledge, ritual chants and songs, and other non-material power resources. The elders' squelching of young people's desire to play and dance to *cumbias* along the Mirití-Paraná River on Colombian Independence Day, 1989, was a clear illustration of this more general propensity to construct hierarchies based on ritual power. Without any fanfare or even open, public assertion (much less debate or negotiation), this ritual hierarchy determined that "música de los blancos" did not belong *inside* the round-house on that evening. The ceremonial flute players resumed their counter-clockwise circling of the four great houseposts, the Comisario put away his boombox, and not another word was spoken aloud about "la música de los blancos."

The events of Independence Day, 1989, clearly demonstrated that indigenous cultural practices and political organization were still very effective at the level of local communities along the Mirití-Paraná River. In spite of the dramatic changes in the politics of indigenous identities that were developing at national and regional levels in Colombia during the 1980s, the Yukuna and Tanimuka were constructing a compartmentalized modernity in which daytime festivities practiced outside the roundhouse were not to be mixed with nighttime performances held inside the roundhouse. On that night, the contradictions between

¹³ See Hill 1984 for a discussion of ritual hierarchy among the Arawakan Wakuénai of Venezuela and Hill 1993 for an extended analysis of ritual power in Wakuénai society. Also, see Hill and Santos-Granero (Hill and Santos-Granero 2002) for a comparative study of hierarchy and ritual power among Arawak-speaking peoples of South America.

indigenous social life and Colombian nationalism were not so much resolved through public dialogue as they were dramatized through the non-verbal metadiscourses of competing musicalities. The fact that this power struggle between generations manifested itself primarily as a musical battle was hardly surprising and perhaps even predictable given the prominence of music and musicality in the mythic narratives and ritual performances throughout Northwestern Amazonia. By compartmentalizing modernity within the soon-to-be besieged Colombian nation-state, the Yukuna and Tanimuka participated in the national rituals of Independence Day without undermining the integrity of their own seasonally based communal celebrations.

Essentialized Modernity: the Erasure of Indigenous Identities

In 1998 I developed a research project on "Trickster Narratives and Social Constructions of History"15 that allowed me to return to the Upper Rio Negro region of Venezuela where I had done extensive fieldwork in the early 1980s. In Caracas, I met with the Director of the Office of Indigenous Affairs in the Ministry of Education, and as part of my request for official permission to do fieldwork in the Upper Rio Negro region I promised to make bilingual (Spanish and Curripaco) texts of indigenous mythic and historical narratives available to the Ministry of Education for use in its program of bilingual, intercultural education (Regimen de Educación Intercultural Bilingüe, or REIB). After a few days of renewing old friendships and professional ties in Caracas, I flew down to Puerto Ayacucho, a small city on the middle Orinoco that serves as a point of departure for the Rio Negro and other destinations within the State of Amazonas. My plan was to gather the required signatures from the Governor, National Guard, and Regional Office of Indigenous Affairs on the Ministry of Education's formal letters, buy a six-week supply of trade goods and personal items, and reserve space on a commercial flight to Maroa. I was dismayed to learn that such flights were much less frequent in 1998 than they had been in the early 1980s, when two companies sent out at least six flights per week. Due to the decline of Venezuela's economy in the 1980s and '90s,

¹⁴ See Hill 1993 for a complete analysis of the importance of musical sounds, voices, and instruments in indigenous myths and social life among the Wakuénai of Venezuela. See also Hill 1997 for an example of how musical performances became the primary medium for social protest against predatory economic practices.

¹⁵ The project was supported by grants from the Office of Research and Development at Southern Illinois University Carbondale, the National Endowment for the Humanities Summer Research Fellowship program, and the Wenner-Gren Foundation for Anthropological Research. From June through December, 1998, I was affiliated as a Visiting Researcher with the Department of Anthropology at the Venezuelan Scientific Research Institute (IVIC) in Caracas.

the cost of air travel had become prohibitively expensive for most local people in Amazonas, and the number of flights had been severely reduced. The best I could do was to reserve a flight some two weeks in advance.

I had done some survey research in Puerto Ayacucho and surrounding communities during the mid-1980s and knew that there were significant numbers of Curripaco-speakers living nearby. So to avoid losing time while waiting for the flight to Maroa and to refresh my skills in speaking and listening to the indigenous language, I made contact with Curripaco-speakers in the area and hired an old friend to serve as motorist. We made arrangements for me to work in a predominantly Evangelical Protestant community about 20 minutes' drive outside of Puerto Ayacucho. Early each morning we would stop at the local fish market to survey the day's catch and buy a few kilos of fresh fish for the afternoon meal. The community was located in a fairly remote area near a small tributary of the Orinoco and offering a splendid view of the rain forests and mountains that spread east and south of the city. An Evangelical Church had been built on high ground commanding the best view, and a row of private households extended back from the road across from the church. My linguistic collaborator was a middle-aged man, Javier, originally from the Isana River in Brazil who spoke the Curricarro dialect used by the people from the Rio Guainía (Negro) where I had recorded numerous mythic and historical narratives during the early 1980s.

After the first few days, Javier had become accustomed to my style of transcribing with cassette recorder and laptop computer, and I began to overcome the initial linguistic "shock" of returning to a language that I had listened to but not spoken for a period of several years. We established a daily routine of working on transcription and translation of narratives from about mid-morning until early afternoon. Javier's wife and daughters usually returned from the manioc gardens around noon and began cooking manioc breads to go along with the fish of the day. The women's budare, or large clay manioc oven and griddle, was situated only a few feet away from our transcription table, so the women overheard much of our work. And the heat from their oven magnified the ferocious natural midday heat of the sun-baked llanos and scrub forested landscape. Completely drenched in sweat, we were ready to take a break from transcribing by the time the meal of fish and manioc had been fully prepared. After our meals, Javier and I would rest or take short walks to visit nearby gardens or look for medicinal plants in forests along the river. If time and energy allowed, I would spend a final hour in mid-afternoon asking questions about the work we had completed earlier in the day and discussing plans for the next day's work. Returning with my friend to Puerto Ayacucho, powerful thunderstorms that would bring cooling, nocturnal relief from the day's heat almost invariably filled the late afternoon skies.

Toward the end of my second week of working with Javier, we were resting after our customary meal of fish and manioc when he observed that the stories that we were transcribing were really meant to be told and heard during the cool evening hours at the end of a day's work. Cold beverages such as beer and soda would also make the experience of listening to the stories more enjoyable. As usual, I had brought with me copies of cassette tape recordings of indigenous flute music, chanting, and singing from my work in the Rio Negro during the early 1980s. So in response to Javier's invitation, I returned that evening with two friends from Puerto Ayacucho, a cooler stocked with ice-cold beer and soda, a tape recorder, and my copies of indigenous musical and narrative performances. Within minutes, the patio in front of Javier's house was filled with women and young people who were keenly interested in listening to and discussing my tape recordings. Two of the older women talked about their memories of hearing these same songs, chants, and flute pieces many years ago when they were still very young, before the New Tribes missionaries arrived and converted people to fundamentalist Christianity. Javier and I talked about the primordial human being of myth, or Kuwái, who forms the principal subject of the long series of chants and songs performed in male initiation rituals and other rites of passage. In his opinion, "Kuwái es nosotros, los hombres." I found this statement to be a very interesting, if somewhat Durkheimian, sociological interpretation and was about to engage in a lengthy dialogue with Javier when our little fiesta was suddenly and decisively brought to a halt.

The village headman, who was an old Curripaco from the Rio Guainía (Negro), approached us and stood in the center of the gathering of women and young people. He was trying without much success to restrain his anger and yelled (in Curripaco) at Javier to turn off the tape recorder and send everyone home immediately. He was accompanied by the Comisario, a Uanano (Eastern Tukanoan) man married to one of his daughters, who reiterated the headman's orders in Spanish. "No se puede tocar o escuchar esta música aqui en este pueblo! Es una cosa del Diablo, es malo para la gente." My two friends from Puerto Ayacucho, who were members of a family of Baniwa-speakers from Maroa on the Rio Guainía, "6 were angered by the headman and Comisario's

¹⁶ They had grown up mainly in Puerto Ayacucho but had made many visits to the Rio Guainía and identified with their Baniwa heritage. Their great-great-grandfather, Venancio Camico (or Kamiko), is still remembered throughout the Rio Negro as the leader of an important messianic movement in the late 1850s (see Wright and Hill 1986; Hill and Wright 1988). One of them was studying anthropology at the Universidad Central de Venezuela, and I was planning to help her develop a proposal for research on Baniwa shamanism for her Licenciatura degree.

intervention. They began to protest that it was a violation of people's constitutional right to freedom of religion ("libertad de culto") for the headman and his son-in-law to prohibit people from listening to recordings of indigenous music. After all, no one was forcing people to come over to Javier's house to listen. "El viejo es loco," commented one of my friends. The women and young people scattered for their houses as soon as they saw the old man's anger. I gathered my tape recorder, said goodbye to Javier, and managed to persuade my two friends that we should leave immediately. I was hoping that by complying with the headman and his son-in-law's orders, I could minimize any damage to Javier's relations with his wife's family. Perhaps we could even continue our work of transcribing and translating narrative discourses as long as we stayed in Javier's household and refrained from working on tapes of sung or chanted speeches.

The next morning, Javier and I began our usual work activities, and the Comisario came over and told us to stop working. As a Uanano who spoke in Spanish rather than Curripaco, he did not understand the language in which Javier and I were working, much less any of the cultural meanings of the narratives. "Esto es malo, una cosa del Diablo, una cosa del pasado y no del futuro. Nosotros no queremos vivir en el pasado, queremos ir al futuro, y esta cosa ind\(\text{kgena}\) no va continuar, no tiene ning\(\text{un}\) lugar en el futuro. Usted tiene que salir de este pueblo." We packed up my equipment and left for Puerto Ayacucho. Javier came with us, and from then on we worked under the little churuata in back of my friend's house in town. And that is how we continued working until my departure for Maroa a few days later and during subsequent stays in Puerto Ayacucho while en route between Caracas and Maroa.

Many times during my fieldwork in the 1980s I had encountered evangelical Curripaco-speakers in villages along the Guainía and Casiquiare Rivers. Large numbers of Curripaco had been converted to Evangelical Christianity during the 1950s and '60s under the leadership of Sophia Muller, a fundamentalist North American missionary affiliated with the New Tribes Mission. Sophia and her New Tribes colleagues used brainwashing and psychological terror in their efforts to eradicate all of the most central elements of indigenous Curripaco religious beliefs and practices. Indigenous people were taught to be ashamed of their social and religious practices, which were labeled in frankly denigrative terms as "evil" forms of "devil worship." Indigenous shamans and chant-owners were especially targeted as agents of evil, and most of them were ostracized by their own kin groups. By the 1980s, an entire generation of Curripaco-speakers had been born and raised into believing that their ancestors' way of life was an evil thing of the past. The number of Curripaco-speakers remained high or even increased, since the missionaries translated the entire

New Testament into Curripaco and conducted monthly "Semana Santa" services in that language. By the time of my fieldwork with the Curripaco in the early 1980s, there were very few senior men who still actively practiced the singing and chanting of shamanic curing rituals and major rites of passage. A somewhat more tolerant attitude toward these ritual specialists had developed by the 1980s among many of the evangelical Curripaco, who were frequent consumers of shamanic ritual healing. Nevertheless, Sophia Muller and other missionaries continued to preach that all such indigenous rituals were 'evil,' and they did everything possible to prevent the resurgence of indigenous shamanic and other rituals.

The missionaries' ideology equated "good" with "Christianity," "modernity," and "capitalist prosperity." Much like the founding ideologies of the architects of independent nation-states in the early 19th century, the missionaries targeted indigenous traditions as an uncivilized, past, "evil," ignorant, savagery that would over time be assimilated into a future state of civilized, enlightened modernity. It is not a coincidence that the missionaries' propagation of a staunchly nationalist trope of modernity in the 1950s through 1970s flourished in the context of Cold War ideological battles between "good"-"Christian"-"capitalism" and an "evil"-"atheistic"-"communism" (see Hill 1994). When the headman and his Uanano son-in-law ordered Javier and me to leave the community on that June day in 1998, it was precisely in the discourse of this modernist ideology that they justified their actions. What was impressive about their invocation of modernism was the passion with which they believed in its central tenet that indigenous cultures belong only in the past and must continue to be erased in the present so that they have no place in the future. Even though the Cold War had ended nearly a decade before 1998 and the New Tribes missionaries had largely ceased to work among Venezuela's indigenous peoples, their teachings had become so completely absorbed and accepted as "the truth" by the evangelical Curripaco that their only way of responding to an expression of interest in indigenous cultural practices was through vehemently suppressing them in what amounted to an act of "ethnic self-cleansing." In the waning days of the two-party system of Venezuelan democracy, the evangelical Curripaco were oddly out of sync with the politics of the day. Most indigenous communities (including many of the non-Evangelical Curripaco) were strategically recovering and projecting culturally specific identities as ways of creating new spaces of modernity within the nation-state, which was about to undergo a radical change itself. The younger generation has learned about these strategic recoveries of indigenous identities in school and through mass media, and it remains to be seen whether or not there is a place for the headman and his son-in-law's cultural censorship in the future.

Shamanic Modernity: the Recovery of Indigenous Identities

Traveling by small plane from Puerto Ayacucho to Maroa, I returned to the site of my doctoral research in the Upper Rio Negro region of the Venezuelan Amazon after a 12-year hiatus. A lot had changed during this period of time, both in my understanding of indigenous Curripaco (or Wakuénai) cultural practices and in the historical situation of the indigenous societies of the Upper Rio Negro. Venezuela had shifted from a relatively affluent national society with relatively democratic political institutions into an impoverished country in which democracy was overshadowed by the rise of Hugo Chavéz's Fifth Republic Movement. My research objectives had also changed from a broadly ethnographic focus on ritual power as a process of mediating ecological, social, and historical changes to a somewhat narrower focus on narrative discourses about the mythic trickster as a basis for indigenous ways of remembering and interpreting the historical past.

The most striking change at the local level was that the generation of elders and senior ritual specialists with whom I had studied in the early 1980s had died in the early 1990s, and a new generation of adults had replaced them in positions of leadership. This new generation is aware that they have lost, or are in danger of losing, the rich genres of narrative discourse, ritual chanting, and musical performance of their parents' and earlier generations. The sense of cultural loss was pervasive, and my project on indigenous narratives became part of a collaborative process of cultural recovery in which my field notes and tape recordings from the early 1980s became key resources.

Below I provide a preliminary attempt to document and understand the profound, irreversible changes taking place in Curripaco communities of the Upper Rio Negro region of Venezuela as well as in scholarly approaches to the study of sociocultural changes in lowland South America. For convenience and efficiency of presentation, I have organized these changes into four general categories: 1) the generational change mentioned above, which is coordinate with a shift from orality to literacy; 2) the regional political transformation of the Venezuelan Amazon from a Federal Territory in the 1980s into a state in the early 1990s; 3) the Ministry of Education's attempt to revitalize its program of bilingual, intercultural education; and 4) changes in sociocultural anthropology that have emerged between 1980 and 1998.

Generational changes

In the 1980s, the leadership of the nominally Catholic village where I carried out long-term fieldwork consisted of two senior men who were brothers

and ritual specialists. The more powerful, younger brother, served as the village headman and was renowned throughout the region as a highly effective chant-owner (*malikai liminali*). The older brother was a ritual healer, or shaman (*malirri*), who was less influential in everyday social activities than the chant-owner/headman. Shortly after the death of this headman, the village broke apart, with some members leaving to found a new village in a nearby location and others joining an existing community a few kilometers downstream. The headman's brother took his family to live in San Fernando de Atabapo, where he died in 1993. The late chant-owner's adult son, Felix Oliveros, had learned some but not all of the sacred chants and associated myths. He had also become the headman in his new village.

I went for a brief visit to see Felix on the afternoon of June 16, 1998, in order to explain my new research project to him and to find out if he would be willing to work with me on the project. After getting over his initial surprise at seeing me again after such a long absence, Felix agreed to collaborate in my project on narratives about the mythic trickster. Then he asked me if I still had copies of all the tape recordings that I had made of his father singing and chanting malikai back in the early 1980s. I asked him which of these performances he needed and promised to make him copies during my return to the U.S. in late July and early August. After noting a list of such performances, I asked if he needed a copy of the important counterwitchcraft song about Kuwaikanirri. "No," Felix replied, "I already have that one written down in my notes." That brief exchange set the tone for my fieldwork over the remaining months of 1998. The adult leaders of the community were keenly aware that they were in danger of losing the ancient traditions of shamanic chanting and singing, and they saw tape recordings and written texts as the best ways of recovering from, or preventing, these painful losses.

During subsequent months of fieldwork in the community, it became increasingly clear that the shift to literacy as a way of preserving and transmitting cultural knowledge was part of a broader process of change. Compared to the 1980s, there was much less collective sharing of food and other goods. Instead of holding one or more communal meals each day like his father had done, Felix and his nuclear family ate in their own household. The collective rituals and ceremonies marking off passages in the life cycle or the forming of political alliances among kin groups were also disappearing.

Political changes: from territory to statehood

1998 was an election year in Venezuela, and the entire country was a beehive of political activity. In the national election, Hugo Chavez, who had been the leader of a failed coup d'etat in 1992, won a landslide victory as the

new president and promised to make radical changes to the "corruptocracy". At local and regional levels, however, the established political parties held on to control over gubernatorial and legislative positions of power. Back in the early 1980s, such political changes would have had only sporadic effects on indigenous peoples living in remote areas such as the Upper Rio Negro. By the late 1990s, the Wakuénai and other indigenous peoples of the Amazon region had become actively engaged in Venezuelan politics, in large part because Amazonas had gone from the status of Federal Territory with appointed leaders to statehood with elected leaders in 1991. Also, the various indigenous groups of Amazonas had become organized in the mid-1990s into a pan-indigenous political group called Organización Regional de Pueblos Indígenas de Amazonas (ORPIA). In 1997, ORPIA won a major victory in the Venezuelan Supreme Court in a decision that nullified the 1994 Law of Political-Territorial Division. The Supreme Court supported ORPIA's argument that these divisions (called Municipios) were based on urban criteria and had failed to consider "la especifidad indigena," the cosmovision and sociocultural organization of the ethnic groups. The regime of exception for indigenous communities meant that the new Municipios must be adapted to the specific cultural, ecological, economic, geographic, and historical conditions of indigenous communities. Beyond this goal, the regime of exception, as it became elaborated and interpreted by the Supreme Court and in the indigenous organizations' subsequent "Project on the Law of Division" (November 19, 1997), was designed to allow indigenous peoples to participate in local and state government in ways that would harmonize the rights and interests of indigenous and non-indigenous populations in the region (Informe Annual 1998: 57).

This changing political landscape held out the promise of potential gains for indigenous peoples but also raised the possibility of increasing factionalism, individualism, cronyism, and corruption within indigenous communities. In local and regional elections, households and individuals became allied with one or another of a large number of gubernatorial candidates, resulting in political schisms that sharply divided supporters of the different candidates. At a more general, regional and national level, the end of the Cold War and decentralization of national power structures had opened up new cultural and political spaces for indigenous peoples to recover or revitalize their cultural identities. Ironically, the campaigns of cultural transformation during the Cold War had resulted in a generation of young adults who were left with little of the cultural knowledge and competence of their parents' generation. This new generation of adults expressed an interest in recovering the cultural practices of earlier generations but were largely lacking in the means for effecting such revitalization.

Educational changes: the national program of bilingual, intercultural education

The issue of bilingual, intercultural education has been addressed repeatedly in Venezuela, starting in the early 1980s after the passing of Decreto No. 283 and continuing through the various projects of the early and mid-1990s stimulated by the former director of the Office of Indigenous Affairs. When I arrived in Maroa in June 1998 and inquired about the Pilot Center for indigenous bilingual education, I was informed that the Center was not currently in operation and that there were no ongoing projects to develop bilingual, intercultural education in Maroa and surrounding areas. The case of the Pilot Center in Maroa was not merely an exception to the norm, since the general situation of indigenous bilingual education programs in Venezuela was one of neglect. "In the opinion of many sectors, this program has been abandoned by the State, and for quite some time there has been no effort to follow through nor to implement a politics of promotion for the program" (Informe Annual 1998: 80).

In 1998, the Ministry of Education was attempting to revitalize the Regimen of Intercultural Bilingual Education (or REIB) under the leadership of Gabriela Croes, the new director of the Office of Indigenous Affairs. I met with this new director in June and August of 1998 to discuss the possibility of producing a bilingual, Spanish and Curripaco collection of mythic narratives for use in the bilingual, intercultural education program. These meetings went very well, and officials at the Ministry of Education expressed a strong interest in publishing a collection of mythic narratives as part of a broader process of developing a bilingual curriculum for the Curripaco. When I got back to the Rio Negro, I discussed these publication plans with Felix Oliveros. We agreed that Felix's deceased father, Horacio Lopez Pequeira, would be listed as the book's principal author because my recordings of him from the early 1980s served as the initial point of departure for our ongoing project. At my next meeting with officials at the Ministry of Education, we talked about the book's format, including the idea of publishing two separate volumes of narratives, one in Curripaco and another in Spanish. The officials' reasoning was that teachers would be less likely to rely on the Spanish translations of the narratives if the original Curripaco versions were to be contained in an entirely separate volume.

The idea of producing two separate volumes of narratives, one in each language, was unanimously unpopular among Curripaco residents of the Upper Rio Negro region. After much consultation with families and individuals in the area, Felix and I decided to go along with popular sentiments by formatting the narratives as two columns on the same page. Officials at the Ministry of Education accepted this modification after some discussion in December 1998.

Changes in anthropology

At least since the eruption of the Mead versus Freeman controversy in the early 1980s, anthropologists have recognized that fieldwork is a personally mediated, historically situated activity of producing knowledge. In his critique of the spatializing metaphors underlying relativism, functionalism, structuralism, and other modernist theories in anthropology, Fabian (Fabian 1983) argued that fieldwork carried out over a prolonged period of time could serve as the basis for a reflexive, interpretive (or hermeneutic) distancing. On the one hand, spatialized distancing removed anthropological interlocutors from the same historical space and time as that of the researcher, an act of forgetting or "allochronism" that denied the contemporaneity of the researcher and his or her subjects. Interpretive distancing, on the other hand, requires a conscious and collaborative activity of re-membering, or re-'present'-ing, past experiences so that they can be integrated into individual and collective memories. In effect, researchers and their interlocutors engage in a collaborative project of creating shared pasts. The research subjects have become part of the researcher's history to the extent that their practices extend through (or over) time into the present. Conversely, the researcher's past activities become part of the local community's history to the extent that they are carried forward in time, or re-'present'-ed in a new historical moment.

Both sides of this complex process are salient for understanding my return to the Upper Rio Negro region in 1998. Throughout the 1980s and '90s, I had devoted much of my professional time and effort to documenting and interpreting Wakuénai cultural practices, and in 1997 I had written research proposals that enabled me to take time off from teaching and writing in order to return to the field. At a more personal level, the most striking thing about returning to the field was the harsh reality of hunger due to poor fishing and hunting in the long, April through August wet season. I had written articles in professional journals about the significance of prolonged, severe deprivation during the long wet seasons (Hill 1984; Hill 1989), yet somehow the actual lived experience of deprivation and hunger - that dread of not knowing if and when there would be sufficient food - had receded into a nicely tamed intellectual corner of my consciousness. The wet season of 1998 was especially severe, perhaps due to the effects of El Niño. In any case, the lack of fresh fish and game jolted me back to similar experiences in the early 1980s and reminded me of the need to include this dimension - the sheer natural struggle for survival – into my writings about Wakuénai cultural practices. It is precisely these nonverbal, emotionally laden experiences that make anthropological fieldwork a process of sharing historical space and time rather than a rarified aesthetic or intellectual production.

My previous fieldwork activities in the 1980s were not simply remembered in 1998 but re-activated in new ways. In addition to my tape recordings and field notes, I had brought a lap top computer and portable printer to serve as tools for transcribing and translating narratives about the mythic trickster. Using a program called Shoebox 2.0 for Windows 95, I was able to work through many narratives in a relatively short period of time. My principal collaborator, Felix Oliveros, helped me each day by correcting printed drafts of the narratives. Upon returning to the village in August, I brought along a second laptop computer and donated it to Felix and his nephew, Gabriel Oliveros, the village schoolteacher. By the time of my departure from the field in November, both men had developed an ability to use the computer to make new files, print them, and back them up on diskettes.

The last two decades have been a period of major political, cultural, and technological changes in the Upper Rio Negro and in the world as a whole. The Wakuénai, or Curripaco, of Venezuela have gained new political rights even as they have witnessed the passing away of the last preliterate generation of adults. Anthropologists can play a vital role in these contexts through training indigenous peoples in the use of new computer technologies, video and sound recording, and storing and disseminating their own cultural practices. Ultimately, the results will depend on decisions that the Wakuénai and other indigenous peoples make for themselves.

Conclusions

Investigating the form and content of cultural performances and representations often provides important insights into the power relations embodied in and shaped by social identities. What I hope to have achieved in this essay is to demonstrate that indigenous South American peoples are capable of constructing shared identities as modern citizens of specific nation-states *and* as members of collective, territorialized groups "characterized more by their marginalized positionality within existing state structures than by a collective desire to secede" (Muehlebach 2003: 245). In different ways, all three of the case studies described above demonstrate the power of ceremonial and ritual performances of music and/or musicalized speech as a key political dimension of defining, reproducing, and transforming indigenous identities. Even in the case where this power was negated or suppressed through censorship, the clear implication is that such performances were not experienced as mere representations of received cultural meanings but as active embodiments of mythic and historical forces that have powers of shaping social identities in the present.

Another point that emerges from the three case studies outlined in this essay is that there is great variation in the local politics of identity among indigenous

communities and peoples of South America. Accordingly, it is important to include a concern for contexts of regional and national power relations that mediate between the local and the global at specific moments in history. To the extent that nation-states have developed new legal codes embracing rights of self-determination based on cultural differences, indigenous peoples have new opportunities for creating new spaces of relational autonomy that foster interdependence among local communities, nation-states, and transnational political economies rather than secessionist movements of political independence. Of course, the success of these newly emerging politics of indigenous identity will also depend on the degree to which nation-states are able and willing to intervene at the level of regional politics in order to implement and enforce legal codes that are designed to promote indigenous self-determination. This dimension of identity politics became strikingly clear in the Venezuelan Amazon in 1997 when the national Supreme Court overrode the state legislature's attempt to undermine and obstruct implementation of the regime of exception for indigenous peoples in the implementation of the 1994 Law of Political-Territorial Division and the formation of new municipios. Without this intervention from the national Supreme Court, the spirit of the 1994 Law would have been diluted or subverted, and indigenous peoples would have found themselves back in the same conditions that they had been forced to endure since the rise of independent liberal nation-states in the early 19th century.

Conversely, where nation-states are unwilling or unable to bring about the implementation of new legal codes that recognize and support indigenous self-determination, indigenous communities are left to the mercies of political forces that have filled the power vacuum in remote borderlands and frontiers. In Colombia, for example, the passage of new laws granting legal title over extensive tracts of land to indigenous peoples living along the Vaupés, Caquetá, and Putumayo rivers can be interpreted as a desperate and largely unsuccessful attempt to establish a measure of national control over areas that came to be increasingly under the power of insurgent political organizations and drug lords during the 1980s and '90s. The extent to which the Colombian state was able to enforce the new indigenous land titles of the 1980s grew more and more doubtful during the 1990s, as the FARC and drug lords took de facto control over the entire region. And in Venezuela, the national government's inability to fully implement Decreto No. 283, or the 1983 law mandating a national program of bilingual, intercultural education for all indigenous peoples, led to a situation in which education was still largely an instrument of assimilation wielded by missionaries and secular teachers who knew and cared little about the cultural specificities of local indigenous communities.

In this context, anthropologists can play an important role in helping indigenous communities to navigate the complex and rapidly changing political

conditions in the contemporary world. Examples of anthropologists as political activists abound in the Americas. One of the most compelling and successful cases in recent years was the testimony provided by Charles Hale, Rodolfo Stavenhagen, and other anthropologists at the Inter-American Human Rights Court in 2001 in San José, Costa Rica, where the Awas Tingni succeeded in winning their struggle for land rights against the Nicaraguan state based on community claims that demonstrated knowledge of and connections to specific tracts of land (Gordon, Gurdián, and Hale 2003). The case is especially important because it establishes an international legal precedent for acknowledging that unwritten forms of historical knowledge transmitted through oral narratives, ritually chanted speeches, and associated cultural practices can serve as the legal basis for a peoples' claims over specific territories. What anthropologists have known and empirically demonstrated for many years - that ritual practices and narrative discourses are crucial ways of linking local peoples to their environments – has now been recognized in the Americas by an international court of law as a valid principle that can override the claims of national governments. This development has important implications for indigenous peoples who are concerned with recovering cultural practices that have been undermined or weakened by decades of missionary activity and assimilationist schooling. Anthropologists who have documented, recorded, and interpreted indigenous cultural practices have a professional obligation to make their accumulated knowledge available to indigenous peoples who are in the process of asserting new forms of selfdetermination based on culture as a collective and territorialized practice.

As the Awas Tingni and other cases demonstrate, these new legal approaches to self-determination for indigenous and other marginalized, disenfranchised peoples depend on the willingness of nation-states to work at trans- or international levels through the Organization of American States, the European Economic Community, the United Nations, and other supra-national agencies. It is sadly ironic that at the very moment in world history when international activists and legal scholars are advancing sophisticated, nuanced approaches to cultural differences, understood as multidimensional collective and territorialized practices (Muehlebach 2003: 261), that the only remaining Superpower in the post-Cold War era has embarked on a course of "preemptive warfare" that is destroying the very possibility for settling social problems through international law and cooperation. And it is perhaps even more ironic that some anthropologists should sound a false alarm by attributing unspecified "dangerous political consequences" (Kuper 2003: 395) to the "indigenous peoples' movement" when it is clearly the unbridled economic forces of global capitalism and neoliberal democracy that threaten to have dire political consequences for indigenous peoples as well as the nation-states, such as Colombia and Venezuela, in which they are entangled during the early years of the 21st century.

References

- Armstrong Gary. 2002. Talking up the Game: Football and the Reconstruction of Liberia, West Africa, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(4): 471–494.
- Boccara Guillaume. 2003. Rethinking the Margins/Thinking from the Margins Culture, Power, and Place on the Frontiers of the New World, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 10(1): 59–81.
- Carter Thomas. 2002. On the Need for an Anthropological Approach to Sport, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(3): 405–422.
- Chernela Janet. 1993. *The Wanano Indians of Brazil: a Sense of Space*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Colloredo-Mansfeld Rudi. 2002. Autonomy and Dependence in Native Movements: Towards a Pragmatic Politics in the Ecuadorian Andes, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(2): 173–195.
- Coronil Fernando. 2000. Magical Illusions or Revolutionary Magic: Chávez in Historical Context, *Hugo Chávez, Venezuela's Redeemer?* NACLA Report on the Americas XXXIII (6): 34–42.
- Fabian Johannes. 1983. *Time and the Other: how Anthropology Makes its Object*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Godreau Isar. 2002. Changing Space, Making Race: Distance, Nostalgia, and the Folklorization of Blackness in Puerto Rico, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(3): 281–304.
- Goldman Irving. 1963. *The Cubeo Indians of the Northwest Amazon*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Gordon Edmund, Galio Gurdián, and Charles Hale. 2003. Rights, Resources and the Social Memory of Struggle: Reflections on a Study of Indigenous and Black Community Land Rights on Nicaragua's Atlantic Coast, *Human Organization* 62(4): 369–381.
- Gow David and Joanne Rappaport. 2002. The Indigenous Public Voice: the Multiple Idioms of Modernity in Native Cauca, K. Warren and J. Jackson (eds.). *Indigenous Movements, Self-Representation, and the State in Latin America*: 47–80. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Graham Laura. 2002. How Should an Indian Speak? Amazonian Indians and the Symbolic Politics of Language in the Global Public Sphere, K. Warren and J. Jackson (eds.). *Indigenous Movements, Self-Representation, and the State in Latin America*: 181–228. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Grau Pedro Cunill. 1987. Geografia del Poblamiento Venezolano en el Siglo XIX. 3 Volumes. Caracas: Ediciones de la Presidencia de la República.
- Helman Sara. 2002. Monologic Results of Dialogue: Jewish-Palestinian Encounter Groups as Sites of Essentialization, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(3): 327–354.
- Hill Jonathan. 1984. Social Equality and Ritual Hierarchy: the Arawakan Wakuénai of Venezuela, *American Ethnologist* 11(3): 528–544.

Hill Jonathan. 1989. Ritual Production of Environmental History among the Arawakana Wakuénai of Venezuela, *Human Ecology* 17(1): 1–25.

- Hill Jonathan. 1993. Keepers of the Sacred Chants: the Poetics of Ritual Power in an Amazonian Society. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- Hill Jonathan. 1994. Alienated Targets: Military Discourses and the Domination of Indigenous Peoples in Venezuela, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 1(1): 7–34.
- Hill Jonathan. 1997. Musicalizing the Other: Shamanistic Approaches to Ethnic-Class Competition in the Upper Rio Negro Region, L. Sullivan (ed.). *Enchanting Powers: Music in the World's Religion*: 139–158. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Hill Jonathan. 1999. Indigenous Peoples and the Rise of Independent Nation-States in Lowland South, F. Salomon and S. Schwartz (eds.). *The Cambridge History of Native Peoples of the Americas: South America* III (Part 2): 704–764. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Hill Jonathan and Fernando Santos-Granero (eds.). 2002. *Comparative Arawakan Histories: Rethinking Language Family and Culture Area in Amazonia*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Hill Jonathan and Susan Staats. 2002. Re-Delineando el Curso de la Historia: Estados Euro-Americanos y las Culturas sin Gente, G. Boccara (ed.). *Mestizaje, Etnogénesis y Identidades en las Américas*: 13–26. Quito/Lima: Abya Yala/Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos.
- Hill Jonathan and Thomas Wilson. 2003. Identity Politics and the Politics of Identities; *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 10(1): 1–8.
- Hill Jonathan and Robin Wright. 1988. Time, Narrative, and Ritual: Historical Interpretations from an Amazonian Society, J. Hill (ed.). *Rethinking History and Myth: Indigenous South American Perspectives on the Past*: 78–105. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Hugh-Jones Christine. 1979. From the Milk River: Spatial and Temporal Proceses in Northwest Amazonia. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hugh-Jones Stephen. 1979. The Palm and the Pleiades: Initiation and Cosmology in Northwest Amazonia. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Informe Annual. 1998. Situación de los Derechos Humanos en el Estado Amazonas. Oficina de Derechos Humanos del Vicariato Apostólico de Puerto Ayacucho, Venezuela.
- Jackson Jean. 1983. The Fish People: Linguistic Exogamy and Tukanoan Identity in Northwest Amazonia. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jackson Jean. 1989. Is there a Way to Talk about Making Culture without Making Enemies?, *Dialectical Anthropology* 14(2): 127–144.
- Jackson Jean. 1995. Culture, Genuine and Spurious: the Politics of Indianness in the Vaupés, Colombia, *American Ethnologist* 22(1): 3–27.

- Jackson Jean. 1999. The Politics of Ethnographic Practice in the Colombian Vaupés, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 6(2–3): 281–317.
- Kuper Adam. 2003. The Return of the Native. CA Forum on Anthropology in Public, *Current Anthropology* 44(3): 389–395.
- McKinley Michelle. 2003. Planning Other Families: Negotiating Population and Identity Politics in the Peruvian Amazon, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 10(1): 31–58.
- Muehlebach Andrea. 2003. What Self in Self-Determination? Notes from the Frontiers of Transnational Indigenous Activism, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 10(2): 241–268.
- Overmyer-Velázquez Rebecca. 2003. The Self-determination of Indigenous Peoples and the Limits of United Nations Advocacy in Guerrero, Mexico (1998–2000), *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 10(1): 9–29.
- Rabinowitz Dan. 2002. Oriental Othering and National Identity: a Review of Early Israeli Anthropological Studies of Palestinians, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(3): 305–325.
- Ramos Alcida. 2003. Comment on the Return of the Native by Adam Kuper, *Current Anthropology* 44(3): 397–398.
- Rausch Elizabeth. 1984. *A Tropical Plains Frontier: the Llanos of Colombia, 1531–1831.* Albuquerque: University of New México Press.
- Reichel-Dolmatoff Gerardo. 1971. Amazonian Cosmos. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Reichel-Dolmatoff Gerardo. 1975. *The Shaman and the Jaguar*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Santos-Granero Fernando. 2002. Boundaries are Made to be Crossed: the Magic and Politics of the Long-lasting Amazon/Andes Divide, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(4): 545–569.
- Sorek Tamir. 2002. The Islamic Soccer League in Israel: Setting Moral Boundaries by Taming the Wild, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 9(4): 445–470.
- Turner Terence. 2002. Representation, Polyphony, and the Construction of Power in a Kayapó Video, K. Warren and J. Jackson (eds.). *Indigenous Movements, Self-Representation, and the State in Latin America*: 229–250. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Warren Kay and Jean Jackson. 2002. Introduction: Studying Indigenous Activism in Latin America, K. Warren and J. Jackson (eds.). *Indigenous Movements, Self-Representation, and the State in Latin America*: 1–46. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Whitten Norman E. Jr. (ed.). 2003. *Millennial Ecuador: Critical Essays on Cultural Transformations and Social Dynamics*. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press.
- Wright Robin and Jonathan Hill. 1986. History, Ritual, and Myth: Nineteenth-Century Millenarian Movements in the Northwest Amazon, *Ethnohistory* 33(1): 31–54.

Čiabuvių tapatumų politika Pietų Amerikoje, 1989-1998

Jonathan D. Hill

Santrauka

Straipsnis pradedamas dabartinių bandymų surasti subtilesnius ir veiksmingesnius būdus apibrėžti čiabuvių kultūrines, teritorines ir kitas žmonių teises apžvalga. Šiuolaikiniai čiabuvių judėjimai Lotynų Amerikoje yra nukreipti prieš ilgą istoriją turinčią kolonijinės ir nacionalinės valstybės ekspansiją, kuri nuolat pažeidinėjo šias teises, joms prieštaravo ar jas neigė. Nors dauguma antropologų yra atviri šiuolaikiniams čiabuvių judėjimams Lotynų Amerikoje ir į juos žiūri kaip į svarbius socialinius istorinius procesus, kuriuos reikia rimtai tyrinėti, kai kurie mokslininkai šiuos judėjimus pavaizdavo neabejotinai neigiamai vadindami juos rasistiniais, romantizuotais senųjų "primityvumo" sampratų atgimimais. Šio straipsnio autorius kritikuoja tokius neigiamus čiabuvių socialinių judėjimų apibūdinimus parodydamas, kad minėtais atvejais nepavyksta adekvačiai atskirti dviejų sąvokų – anglų k. identity politics ir the politics of identity. Pirmoji sąvoka reiškia, kad tapatumo politiką plačiu mastu vykdo nečiabuvių politinės, ekonominės ir socialinės jėgos. O antroji sąvoka žymi procesus, kai vietinės čiabuvių bendruomenės meta iššūkį kultūrai ir tapatumui, juos griauna ar dėl jų veda derybas bei kovoja su jų socialinius gyvenimus varžančiomis galios ir gerovės struktūromis.

Straipsnyje tapatumų politika tyrinėjama trijose Pietų Amerikos vietose, kuriose autorius atliko lauko tyrimus XX a. devintajame ir dešimtajame dešimtmečiais. Pirmuoju tyrinėjamu atveju atidžiai nagrinėjama, kaip atokiose miškingose vietovėse pietryčių Kolumbijoje gyvenančios čiabuvių Jukuna ir Tanimuka bendruomenės konstravo "padalytą" (compartmentalized) nacionalinį tapatumą XX a. devintojo dešimtmečio pabaigoje. Šis tapatumas leido joms dalyvauti nacionaliniuose ritualuose, pavyzdžiui, švęsti Kolumbijos nepriklausomybės dieną, ir nesuardyti jų pačių sezoniškumu paremtų bendruomeninių švenčių vientisumo. Vietinis "padalyto" tapatumo – čiabuviško ir čiabuvių prisilaikomo nacionalinio tapatumo – konstravimas vyko tuo metu, kai Kolumbijos nacionalinė valstybė sparčiai užleidinėjo pozicijas politiniams sukilėliams ir didelio masto transnacionalinei narkotikų prekybai.

Antrasis tyrinėjamas atvejis parodo, kaip čiabuvių tapatumai buvo naikinami ar slopinami laikantis fetišizuotos, esencializuotos modernybės ideologijos kuripakiškai (*Curripaco-speaking*) kalbančioje bendruomenėje netoli Venesuelos Amazonės valstijos sostinės Puerto Ajakučo XX a. paskutiniojo dešimtmečio pabaigoje. Ši ideologija "gėrį" sutapatino su "krikščionybe", "modernybe"

bei "kapitalizmo gerove", o čiabuvių tradicijas prilygino "necivilizuotumui", "praeičiai", "blogiui", "neišmanymui", "laukiniškumui" – tam, ką ilgainiui asimiliuos būsima civilizuota, apšviesta modernybė.

Nagrinėdamas trečiąjį, paskutinįjį, atvejį, autorius svarsto, kaip jo paties tiriamoji veikla, t. y. Kuripako mitinių naratyvų ir atliekamų ritualų tradicijų užrašymas, šifravimas ir interpretavimas, XX a. devintajame ir dešimtajame dešimtmečiais prisidėjo prie vietos čiabuvių pastangų susigrąžinti kultūrines praktikas, kurios buvo svarbus jų istorijos ir tapatumo bruožas. Šių bandymų atgauti kultūrą rezultatas buvo kultūriškai ypatingas tapatumas, paremtas čiabuvių šamanistinėmis praktikomis, kurios taip pat buvo naudotos siekiant sukurti naujas modernybės erdves radikalius pokyčius patiriančioje Venesuelos nacionalinėje valstybėje.

Straipsnis baigiamas teiginiu, kad Lotynų Amerikos čiabuvių judėjimus galima geriau suprasti žiūrint į juos kaip į procesus, kai konstruojami bendri – tam tikrų nacionalinių valstybių šiuolaikinių piliečių *ir* kolektyvinių teritorinių grupių narių – tapatumai, o ne traktuojant juos esant vien rasistines, romantizuotas "primityvumo" ideologijas, kurios verčiamos tarnauti kairiųjų politiniams tikslams. Užuot neigiamai vertinus čiabuvių socialinius judėjimus, vertėtų imtis detalaus jų tapatumų politikos tyrinėjimo vietiniu, regioniniu ir nacionaliniu lygmeniu, nes tai atskleistų sudėtingą įvairiomis istorinėmis kryptimis vykstančių socialinių procesų derinį.

Gauta 2009 m. rugpjūčio mėn.